

Matilija Coalition - Alternatives Scoring

MEASURES	OBJECTIVES/CRITERIA						General Rationale/Key Considerations	TOTAL
	Habitat	Fish Passage	Beach Nourishment	Total Cost	Recreation/ Public Access	Aesthetics		
Full Fish Ladder/No Dam Removal	1	1	1	4	1	1	limited flows restrict feasibility of full fish ladder - does not achieve key objectives	9
Restoration of Dam	1	1	1	2	1	1	restored reservoir is redundant (Lake Casitas provides adequate storage) - does not attain key objectives	7
Fish Tunnel/Bypass to North Fork Matilija	1	1	1	5	1	1	limited feasibility - does not attain project objectives (this alternative was originally proposed as a temporary flow diversion measure during other sediment removal alternatives)	10
Pool & Riffle System	3	3	3	2	2	1	does not restore natural condition of creek, but would achieve most project objectives - cost estimates may be low, since this would require complete removal of dam PLUS construction of new structures	14
Full Dam Removal/Mechanical Sediment Removal	4	5	4	1	5	3	limits both benefits and impacts to downstream habitat - mechanical removal will be costly, and may have other impacts	22
Full Dam Removal/Natural Sediment Transport	5	5	5	4	4	5	maximizes both benefits and impacts to downstream habitat - SEDIMENT TRANSPORT MODEL will define feasibility	28
Incremental Dam Removal/Natural Sediment Transport	5	4	5	3	4	4	maximizes benefits while minimizing impacts - longer implementation - SEDIMENT TRANSPORT MODEL will define feasibility	25
Full Dam Removal/Stabilize Sediment On-site	4	5	3	3	3	3	common method of dam removal, limits downstream impacts while attaining project objectives	21
Partial Dam Removal/Full Sediment Removal	2	3	1	1	1	1	if pool is maintained behind dam, fish passage MAY improve over full ladder, but project does not adequately achieve other key objectives	9
Partial Dam Removal/Natural Sediment Transport	4	4	5	3	1	1	"V-notch" would attain project objectives as "full dam removal with natural sediment transport", but remaining structure would limit public access and aesthetics	18
Partial Dam Removal/Partial Sediment Removal	2	2	2	2	1	1	expensive proposal that does not fully achieve project objectives	10